



City of Moose Jaw

COMMUNICATION # CC-2021-0261

TITLE: Citizen Request to Refurbish Coteau Street Bridge

TO: City Council

FROM: Department of Engineering Services

DATE: September 15, 2021

PUBLIC: PUBLIC DOCUMENT

RECOMMENDATION

THAT Mr. Doug Reichel, a Citizen of the City of Moose Jaw, be allowed to address City Council; and,

THAT Mr. Reichel's request to refurbish the Coteau Street Bridge to a pedestrian/cyclist only bridge be denied; and further,

THAT Communication #CC-2021-0261 regarding Mr. Doug Reichel's request to refurbish the Coteau Street Bridge be received and filed.

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

The purpose of this report is to allow Mr. Doug Reichel to make a presentation with a request to City Council about refurbishing the Coteau Street East bridge as a pedestrian/cyclist only bridge and to convey to the City Engineer to halt all actions to have it destroyed or removed.

BACKGROUND

Resident Concerns:

Mr. Doug Reichel submitted an email on September 14, 2021 (Attachment A) to the City Clerk's Office stating he would like to make a presentation to City Council about keeping the historic Coteau Street East bridge as a pedestrian/cyclist only bridge, halting any plans to have it destroyed/removed. In his email he wrote, "it is an important bridge used by hundreds of cyclists, walkers, and runners every month year-round; that City actions to be ending its use for all motorized traffic, note and plan for any possible refurbishment necessary as a pedestrian/cyclist only bridge." Mr. Reichel further requests that nothing

happens to this bridge until he has made a presentation at the September 27, 2021 City Council Meeting and that this be conveyed to the City Engineer.

Public submissions have been received from other City residents and have been included in this communication as Attachment E.

Coteau Street Bridge:

City Council provided approval to demolish the Coteau Street East Bridge in the 2021 Budget. The Department of Engineering Services has engaged and received approval from Canadian National Railways (CN Railways) to cost share the project. Engineering Services is currently engaging a consultant to demolish the Coteau Street East Bridge.

Built in 1908, the Coteau Street East Bridge is a 6.0 metre wide bridge that spans over the CN Railway. The width of the bridge provides sufficient space for two sidewalks and one driving lane. It provides an access to the International Bible College on the east side of the bridge and sees an average annual daily traffic (AADT) of 50 (Stantec, 2017).

Records indicate various reports to City Council including a public survey undertaken in 2009; this report is attached (B. 2009 Public Survey Report) and summarized below:

In 2009, the Engineering Department engaged stakeholders local to the area for three options for the future of Coteau Street East Bridge:

- 1) Close the bridge to motor vehicles in two years.*
- 2) Repair the bridge to accommodate motor vehicles for an additional nineteen years and after this time period, the bridge would be used as a pedestrian bridge until demolition.*
- 3) Perform minor repairs to the bridge to accommodate motor vehicles for an additional thirteen years and after this time period, complete a major rehabilitation to accommodate motor vehicles for an additional forty years.*

The City only received seven responses out of 40 letters sent out. Six were from abutting residents and one was from the International Bible College. All of the six residents expressed their support for proceeding with Option 1, whereas the International Bible College requested that the bridge remain open to motor vehicle traffic. They also cited the concern regarding the potential of trains blocking the emergency vehicle access to their property. It should be noted that this railway is not busy, and if needed, emergency vehicles can still access their property from the east side via River Valley Drive. At that time, Option 1 was recommended to City Council, with the intention of closing the bridge to vehicle traffic.

The City engaged Stantec Consulting Services Inc. to provide Pre-Design Reports for Coteau Street East Bridge in 2009, however, no further action was taken.

In 2017, the City engaged Stantec Consulting Services Inc. to complete a Bridge Inventory Re-Evaluation, which consisted of visual inspections and structure evaluations of the City's 15 bridges, six subways, and three dams. This report has two findings of note with respect to the Coteau Street East Bridge:

1. Behind the 7th Avenue SW Bridge and the Thunderbird (4th Ave) Viaduct, Coteau Street East Bridge received the lowest condition ratings.
2. With an extremely low AADT count of 50, this bridge serves a small volume of traffic.

In 2020, the City engaged Associated Engineering to complete a Condition Survey Report. (Attachment C) The Report confirmed that the bridge is beyond its service life, continues to see a declining condition index, and evaluated replacement, refurbishment, and demolition options. A life cycle cost analysis was conducted, with the recommendation being to move forward with demolition.

The 2020 Condition Survey evaluated several options as outlined below:

- Minor maintenance with required replacement in 2025 (vehicular or pedestrian)
\$220,500
- Major rehabilitation with required replacement in 2035 (vehicular or pedestrian)
\$1,562,450
- Demolition
\$150,000

Based on historic information and supported by the 2020 Condition Survey Report, Engineering Services proposed to demolish Coteau Street East Bridge in 2021. This scope was presented and included in the 2021 Capital Budget which was approved by Council. (Attachment D – Demolition Costs - Estimate)

DISCUSSION

The following points reference the attached Condition Survey, completed in 2020:

Section 4 Controlling Factors

- The Survey outlines four controlling, or limiting factors of the existing structure:
- Structural Condition – there are two steel girders supporting the bridge. The north girder “displays 100% section loss in discrete areas”.
- Live Load Capacity – the bridge has a four tonne limit.
- Road Geometry – the residential road connecting from the west of the bridge limits geometric changes.
- Rail Clearance – the structure does not meet Transport Canada Rail Clearance.

Section 7 Analysis of Options

The table below outlines Capital Upgrade and Maintenance Costs:

Life Cycle Cost Analysis for Strategies Considered			
Options	Current Capital Estimate	Maintenance Costs	Net Present Value (\$)
Do Nothing & Replacement 2025	\$0	\$168,000	\$1,513,700
Minor Maintenance & Replacement 2025	\$220,500	\$168,000	\$1,734,200
Major Rehabilitation & Replacement in 2035	\$1,562,450	\$200,000	\$2,558,500
Major Rehabilitation, Conversion to a Pedestrian Bridge & Replacement in 2035	\$1,562,450	\$40,000	\$2,132,000
Minor Maintenance, Conversion to a Pedestrian Bridge & Replacement in 2025	\$220,500	\$40,000	\$1,062,800

Section 9 Recommendations

This section states, "The Coteau Street Bridge is in poor condition and has reached the end of its service life", and confirms "Based on the current condition, the expected demolition year for the structure is currently estimated to be in the next 1 – 5 years."

FINANCIAL IMPLICATIONS

The demolition of Coteau Street East Bridge has been considered and was approved by City Council in the 2021 Capital Budget.

OPTIONS TO RECOMMENDATION

- THAT City Council consider Mr. Doug Reichel's request and advise the Director of Engineering Services to halt all further actions respecting the demolition of the Coteau Street Bridge until further notice.
- THAT City Council consider other alternatives.

PRESENTATION

Mr. Jim Puffalt, City Manager, will introduce the report. Mr. Bevan Harlton, Director of Engineering Services, will be available to answer questions of City Council.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. Request to Address Council from Doug Reichel, September 14, 2021
- B. 2009 Public Survey Report
- C. 2020 Condition Survey Report (AE)
- D. Demolition Costs – Estimate
- E. Public Submissions

REPORT APPROVAL

Written by: Bevan Harlton, Director of Engineering Services
Reviewed by: Tracy Wittke, Acting City Clerk
Approved by: Jim Puffalt, City Manager
Approved by: Dawn Luhning, Acting Mayor

To be completed by the Clerk's Department only.

Presented to Regular Council or Executive Committee on _____.

Resolution No. _____

Report Approval Details

Document Title:	Citizen Request to Refurbish Coteau Street Bridge - CC-2021-0261.docx
Attachments:	<ul style="list-style-type: none">- Attachment A. Request to Address Council from Doug Reichel_Sep14_2021.pdf- Attachment B. 2009 Public Survey Report.pdf- Attachment C. 2020 Condition Survey Report Final.pdf- Attachment D. Demolition Costs - Estimate.pdf- Attachment E. Public Submissions.pdf
Final Approval Date:	Sep 23, 2021

This report and all of its attachments were approved and signed as outlined below:



Bevan Harlton



Tracy Wittke

No Signature - Task assigned to Jim Puffalt was completed by workflow administrator Maureen Latta

Jim Puffalt

Dawn Luhning